

Finance and Resources Committee

10am, Thursday, 23 May 2019

Education and Health & Social Care Transport Framework Agreement

Executive/routine
Wards
Council Commitments [3](#),
[18](#), [34](#)

1. Recommendations

1.1 The Finance and Resources Committee is asked to:

1.1.1 Approve the award of the Education and Health & Social Care Transport Framework Agreement to 66 contractors over four lots.

1.1.2 Approve the total estimated value of contracts, over the four-year period, that shall be awarded under the framework agreement, including extensions, is estimated to be up to £32million. Per lot this equates to:

Lot 1 - £9,600,000.00

Lot 2 - £9,600,000.00

Lot 3 - £9,600,000.00

Lot 4 - £3,200,000.00

1.1.3 Approve the commencement of the framework agreement on 03 July 2019 for a period of three years, with the option to extend for an additional 12 months.

Alistair Gaw

Executive Director of Communities and Families

Contact: Frank Henderson, City Wide Services Manager

E-mail: frank.henderson@edinburgh.gov.uk | Tel: 0131 469 6248

Education and Health & Social Care Transport Framework Agreement

2. Executive Summary

- 2.1 This report seeks the approval for the Finance and Resources Committee to award an Education and Health & Social Care Transport Framework Agreement. It is recommended that 66 contractors are awarded onto the framework agreement over four Lots.
- 2.2 The duration of the framework agreement will be three years, with an option to extend for an additional 12-month period.
- 2.3 Over the four-year period the total value of contracts to be awarded under the framework agreement, including extensions, is estimated to be up to £32million. It should be noted that this value may fluctuate depending on duration and demand.

3. Background

- 3.1 The current Framework Agreement for Education and Health & Social Care Transport (Contract Ref: CT0491) ends in July 2019. Fifty One contractors are on the current framework agreement.
- 3.2 The comparatively high numbers of contractors on these framework agreements is necessary to ensure that sufficient capacity is secured to meet demand and that the Council obtains value for money.
- 3.3 The framework agreement is administered by the Council's Travel Hub (formerly Passenger Operations Unit) within the Place Directorate. Approximately 77,000 passenger journeys a year are booked using this framework agreement, primarily for a range of vulnerable people. The primary users of the framework agreement are the Edinburgh Health and Social Care Partnership (EHSCP) and Communities and Families (C&F), including Safer and Stronger Communities (SSC).
- 3.4 The Travel Hub undertook a review of community and accessible transport and engaged extensively with Parent Councils of all Additional Support Needs (ASN) schools in 2017/18.

- 3.5 The Council is currently undertaking a Travel Demand Management Programme to match requirements, in the context of Communities and Families and the Edinburgh Health and Social Care Partnership with appropriate vehicles.

4. Main report

- 4.1 The Council published a Prior Information Notice (PIN) on the Public Contracts Scotland (PCS) website on 29 March 2018 and a coproduction meeting was held with interested organisations on 16 April 2018.
- 4.2 Key insights and outcomes from the consultation and coproduction (3.4 and 4.1 above) informed revisions to the service specification and related procedures and guidance, such as a requirement for drivers and passenger assistants to be trained in customer care and equality requirements by a Council approved training provider.
- 4.3 The framework agreement contains four lots:
- Lot 1: Vehicle and Driver – Unescorted. No specialist care, or equipment required.
 - Lot 2: Vehicle, Driver and Passenger Assistant. Specialist vehicle and/or equipment may be required.
 - Lot 3: Vehicle, Driver and Passenger Assistant. Specialist vehicle and/or equipment may be required for the transport of vulnerable children and adults.
 - Lot 4: Out of Authority Routes
- 4.4 The lotting structure was agreed to align with the needs of groups of service users and tenderers could choose the lots most suited to the services they offer.
- 4.5 Commercial and Procurement Services (CPS), in conjunction with the service area, undertook a full OJEU tender exercise. On 12 November 2018, the Council published a Contract Notice and Invitation to Tender (ITT) under an Open Procedure, as set out in the Public Contracts (Scotland) Regulations 2015, with a deadline of 7 January 2019.
- 4.6 The procurement procedure allowed the Council to identify suitable tenders in terms of compliance with the procurement regulations and the service specific mandatory criteria. The mandatory criteria included economic standing, insurance levels, a documented Health and Safety policy and two examples that demonstrated the tenderer has the relevant experience to deliver the services. In addition to the specific mandatory criteria, contractors are required to meet all relevant standards, legislative requirements and statutory provisions related to the delivery of the service. To identify contractors offering Best Value the tender evaluation included an emphasis on quality as well as price, and submissions were assessed on the basis of the most economically advantageous tender. The cost: quality ratio was set to reflect quality criteria pertinent to the delivery of the service at the most economical price, whilst also taking account of the mandatory criteria that had been

set. All lots were weighted 10% quality and 90% price. An overall minimum quality threshold of 40% was applied. Details of the evaluation criteria can be found in appendix one, and the scores and ranking of recommended contractors are detailed at appendix two.

- 4.7 On 27 November 2018 CPS conducted a briefing meeting for potential contractors, held in conjunction with the Travel Hub, to ensure clarity around the requirement and procurement process. The briefing covered the key features of the requirements, background, the procurement timetable, an overview of the tender documentation and practical advice for tenderers.
- 4.8 Prior to the commencement of the formal procurement CPS enlisted the support of the Supplier Development Programme in the delivery of a training session to assist potential tenderers in the use of the Public Contracts Scotland portal, tender procedures and the European Single Procurement Document.
- 4.9 A total of 95 contractors registered interest in the Contract Notice, with tenders received from 68 contractors. Two were deemed as non-compliant, therefore 66 were evaluated as meeting the mandatory qualification criteria.
- 4.10 Evaluation of the technical (quality) content of tenderers' submissions was undertaken by an evaluation panel of Council officers from Place and from Communities and Families, chaired by a Council officer from Commercial and Procurement Services.
- 4.11 Due diligence was undertaken in respect of low quality scores and contractors were required to provide written clarifications to ensure that they would meet related requirements in the specification. These scores may be attributed to an unexperienced tenderer, rather than it be a reflection of the provision to be provided. Additional due diligence shall be undertaken by the Travel Hub, both before and during any call off under the framework agreement, including mandatory training requirements in passenger safety for drivers and passenger assistants.
- 4.12 The Travel Hub will, taking account of the needs of the individual service users, and appropriate vehicle types, allocate business to the highest ranked contractor. Approximately 825 individual contracts for combinations of vehicles and routes will be awarded. The framework agreement includes an option for mini competition where new routes are identified.
- 4.13 The Framework agreement shall be managed by the Travel Hub. They will track benefits and work to monitor Key Performance Indicators for the duration of the framework.

5. Next Steps

- 5.1 Subject to approval, the services will commence on 3 July 2019, and shall allow the Council to meet its commitments for provision of transport for Education and Health & Social Care.

- 5.2 A comprehensive implementation plan will be devised by the Travel Hub to ensure that contracts are in place for the transportation of school pupils and when transport is required to be provided by the Council for service users to access health and social care services. This will incorporate demand management, eligibility and travel allocation panels.
- 5.3 The Travel Hub will produce a contract monitoring report for Health and Social Care and Communities and Families on an ongoing basis.

6. Financial impact

- 6.1 The framework agreement value is estimated at £32million over the four-year period. This figure is based on current capacity requirements and may fluctuate over the term of the framework due to the nature of the service.
- 6.2 The potential for any savings will be dependent on contract usage and shall be monitored over the course of the framework agreement term.
- 6.3 The Council has anticipated an increase of 26% in relation to demand over the coming year, with an additional 140 contracts being required to meet demand. This represents current demography forecasting for children and adults in relation to Mainstream Schools, Additional Support Needs Schools, Adult Social Care – Disability and Older Peoples services, including respite.
- 6.4 Implementation of the new framework agreement allows the required capacity of transport provision to be met with the potential for additional capacity available if required.
- 6.5 The prices offered by contractors are cost effective in comparison to alternative ad hoc transport arrangements.
- 6.6 The increased capacity of lower cost contractors will enhance improved cost control.
- 6.7 Prices shall be fixed for the duration of the contract. However, the Council may review costs and prices on an annual basis (or more frequently if the Council believes a review is necessary in light of rapidly changing market conditions).
- 6.8 Any cost/price review will take into account the views of contractors, service users and any indices that the Council may decide to consider, such as, but not limited to the UK Government's Department for Business, Energy and Industrial Strategy (BEIS) statistics on fuel prices. The Council will then decide, for any specific routes or areas, whether or not to invite contractors to take part in a mini competition for those specific routes or areas and submit revised prices. Any subsequent Contracts will be awarded on the basis of the revised ranking.
- 6.9 The costs associated with procuring the framework agreement are estimated to be between £10,001 and £20,000.

7. Stakeholder/Community Impact

- 7.1 The Travel Hub undertook a review of community and accessible transport and engaged extensively with Parent Councils of all Additional Support Needs (ASN) schools in 2017/18.
- 7.2 The Travel Hub also consulted extensively with practitioners working in Communities & Families and the Edinburgh Health and Social Care Partnership to ensure the needs of vulnerable service users were included in the service specification and tender documentation.
- 7.3 Key insights and outcomes from the consultation and coproduction informed revisions to the service specification and related procedures and guidance, such as a requirement for drivers and passenger assistants to be trained in customer care and equality requirements by a Council approved training provider.
- 7.4 The Travel Hub undertook an Integrated Impact Assessment and updated the service specification to take account of the needs of individuals with protected characteristics as described in the Equalities Act 2010.
- 7.5 Through establishment of the new framework agreement the Council fulfils its duties under Section 51 of the Education (Scotland) Act 1980 and the Schools (Safety and Supervision of Pupils) (Scotland) Regulations 1990. The growth in capacity allows for improved resources in terms of fleet size, diversity and flexibility to meet the Council's transport requirements for both fixed and ad hoc routes. Thereby enabling the Council to achieve continuity of service provision to service users.
- 7.6 The Sustainability Procurement Policy was considered and applied through the review of vehicle emissions. The services to be provided will result in vehicle emissions however the Council utilises specific transport routing software to both reduce travel time, costs and environmental impact. The specification also encouraged the use of more environmentally friendly vehicles. The Council has benchmarked with other Scottish local authorities and has stipulated an age limit of maximum ten years for vehicles to be used on the framework agreement. Accordingly, no vehicle shall be accepted if it is over 10 years since the vehicle was first registered or licenced and no vehicle fitted with a Euro 1-4 engine shall be accepted after 31 March 2020, unless granted an exemption that is approved by the Council.
- 7.7 The Council aims to secure community benefits from all contracts with a value of over £50,000 during the lifetime of the framework agreement. Contractors have signed an agreement to provide community benefits where the total value of contracts awarded to them through the framework agreement exceeds £50,000.
- 7.8 The framework agreement recommended for award is compliant with procurement regulations and the Council's Contract Standing Orders. The risk of legal challenge relating to contractual arrangements for the provision of this service is thereby reduced.

8. Background reading/external references

- 8.1 Scottish Government guidance:
<http://www.gov.scot/Topics/Education/Schools/Parents/transport/transport-guidance>
- 8.2 Transport Scotland research:
<https://www.transport.gov.scot/publication/the-costs-and-challenges-of-changing-the-specifications-for-school-transport-in-scotland/>

9. Appendices

- 9.1 Appendix 1 – Summary of Tendering and Tender Evaluation Process
- 9.2 Appendix 2 – Suppliers Recommended for Award and Ranking

Appendix 1 – Summary of Tendering and Tender Evaluation Processes

Contract	Education and Health & Social Care Transport Framework Agreement	
Contract Period	Three years with option to extend by additional 12 months	
Estimated Contract Value (including extensions)	£32,000,000	
Procurement Route Chosen	Open Procedure	
Tenders Returned	68 (66 compliant)	
Names of Recommended Supplier(s)	1212 Taxis AAA Coaches Ltd Abbot Travel AC's Taxis Aerial A.B.W. Cabs Ltd Allan's Coaches Limited Allthefours Inc Avalon Scotland Ltd B and G Taxis Blue Bus Ltd Bodyshop Edinburgh T/A Coach Hire Edinburgh Carr Private Hire Ltd CC Taxis Ltd Central Taxis Edinburgh Ltd Charlie Irons Coaches Chauffeur Cars Scotland Chauffeur Drive (Scotland) Ltd Cherry Private Hire City Cabs Edinburgh Ltd City Circle UK Ltd Coulman Coaches Ltd D&C Taxi's DG Transport Duddingston Transport Ltd	GT Travel H&M Ferguson Ltd Hannings Ltd Ian Mycko J & K Private Hire JJC Taxis Ltd JTS Cars Kinnaird Transport Services Ltd L&M Taxis LA Travel M&D Private Hire Masoka Ltd Midland Bluebird Limited / First Scotland East Limited Midlothian Private Hire Taxis Nancy McElhone P&S Transport Prentice Westwood Ltd. Pro Race Scotland T/A Edinburgh Group Transport Ratho Coaches Ltd S&M Pickering Salmonds Mini Coach Hire Ltd SD Travel Scotland Ltd Seven Sevens Cars Ltd, T/A Capital Cars

	E&M Horsburgh Ltd E&R Taxis Edinburgh City Private Hire Ltd Edinburgh Coach Lines Ltd Edinburgh Taxis Ltd Festival Travel (Scotland) Ltd G and E Taxis Ltd G&R Taxis Garrih Graham GT Private Hire	Shandon Travel Ltd Soave Minibus Hire Steven Kane Taxi Service T&C Cabs Transport Innovation Ltd W&K Scott Ltd t/a Alba Coaches WD Taxis Westcroft Travel Ltd WMD Private Hire
Cost / Quality Split	90% Cost	10% Quality
Quality Evaluation Criteria and Weightings and reason for this approach	<p>To identify providers offering best value the tender evaluation included an emphasis on quality as well as price and submissions were assessed on the most economically advantageous tender. The cost: quality ratio was set to reflect that contractors will have met all relevant standards, legislative requirements and statutory provisions related to the delivery of the Service, in addition to the specific mandatory criteria. All lots were weighted 10% quality and 90% price so that contractors met additional quality criteria pertinent to the delivery of the service at the most economical price.</p> <p>Managing Performance – 20%</p> <p>Customer Service – 20%</p> <p>Business Continuity / Contingency Plans – 20%</p> <p>Sustainability and the Environment – 20%</p> <p>Fair Work Practices – 20%</p>	
Evaluation Team	Two Council Officers from Place and one from Communities and Families	

Appendix 2 – Suppliers Recommended for Award and Ranking

Lot 1: Vehicle and Driver – Unescorted. No specialist care, or equipment required.

Vehicle Type: Taxi / Private Hire Car up to 8 Passenger Seats

Supplier	Quality Score out of 10%	Cost Score out of 90%	100% of Tender to Final Score	Rank
Seven Sevens Cars Ltd, T/A Capital Cars	8.00	90.00	98.00	1
City Cabs Edinburgh Ltd	9.00	87.10	96.10	2
Transport Innovation Ltd	7.50	85.23	92.73	3
Central Taxis Edinburgh Ltd	7.50	75.00	82.50	4
G&R Taxis	4.50	63.98	68.48	5
WMD Private Hire	5.50	62.22	67.72	6
B and G Taxis	4.50	62.21	66.71	7
L&M Taxis	4.50	62.21	66.71	7
D&C Taxi's	4.50	61.09	65.59	8
1212 Taxis	6.50	56.25	62.75	9
Steven Kane Taxi Service	2.50	60.00	62.50	10
M&D Private Hire	5.00	56.74	61.74	11
J & K Private Hire	4.50	56.25	60.75	12
Westcroft Travel Ltd	6.00	54.61	60.61	13
WD Taxis	4.50	53.29	57.79	14
Cherry Private Hire	3.50	53.12	56.62	15
T&C Cabs	5.00	50.52	55.52	16
E&R Taxis	4.00	50.63	54.63	17
GT Private Hire	2.50	43.63	46.13	18
Aerial A.B.W. Cabs Ltd	6.50	39.18	45.68	19
Duddingston Transport Ltd	5.50	39.71	45.21	20
Masoka Ltd	5.50	39.71	45.21	20
Edinburgh City Private Hire Ltd	6.50	34.70	41.20	21
Pro Race Scotland T/A Edinburgh Group Transport	7.00	34.18	41.18	22

Bodyshop Edinburgh T/A Coach Hire Edinburgh	7.00	33.76	40.76	23
Kinnaird Transport Services Ltd	6.00	34.62	40.62	24
CC Taxis Ltd	5.00	34.77	39.77	25
G and E Taxis Ltd	4.00	35.64	39.64	26
P&S Transport	4.50	35.06	39.56	27
S&M Pickering	6.00	32.14	38.14	28
JTS Cars	4.50	32.93	37.43	29
GT Travel	6.00	29.89	35.89	30
Hannings Ltd	6.50	29.35	35.85	31
Chauffeur Drive (Scotland) Ltd	7.50	28.26	35.76	32
Nancy McElhone	5.50	30.00	35.50	33
AC's Taxis	8.00	27.00	35.00	34
Carr Private Hire Ltd	5.50	28.72	34.22	35
Edinburgh Taxis Ltd	3.50	30.50	34.00	36
Shandon Travel Ltd	4.00	30.00	34.00	36
Avalon Scotland Ltd	5.50	27.44	32.94	37
Soave Minibus Hire	6.00	26.73	32.73	38
JJC Taxis Ltd	6.00	26.32	32.32	39
Ratho Coaches Ltd	9.00	22.52	31.52	40
W&K Scott Ltd t/a Alba Coaches	7.50	22.52	30.02	41
H&M Ferguson Ltd	7.50	19.96	27.46	42
SD Travel Scotland Ltd	7.00	18.62	25.62	43
AAA Coaches Ltd	5.00	20.33	25.33	44
LA Travel	5.00	20.33	25.33	44
Festival Travel (Scotland) Ltd	7.00	16.88	23.88	45
Blue Bus Ltd	5.50	15.88	21.38	46
Garrih Graham	6.00	13.64	19.64	47
Chauffeur Cars Scotland	5.50	12.98	18.48	48

Lot 1: Vehicle and Driver – Unescorted. No specialist care, or equipment required.

Vehicle Type: Mini Bus up to 16 Passenger Seats

Supplier	Quality Score out of 10%	Cost Score out of 90%	100% of Tender to Final Score	Rank
S&M Pickering	6.00	90.00	96.00	1
GT Travel	6.00	80.46	86.46	2
Salmonds Mini Coach Hire Ltd	7.00	74.22	81.22	3
Ratho Coaches Ltd	9.00	58.94	67.94	4
W&K Scott Ltd t/a Alba Coaches	7.50	58.94	66.44	5
H&M Ferguson Ltd	7.50	58.06	65.56	6
Avalon Scotland Ltd	5.50	56.57	62.07	7
Pro Race Scotland T/A Edinburgh Group Transport	7.00	54.79	61.79	8
Bodyshop Edinburgh T/A Coach Hire Edinburgh	7.00	54.17	61.17	9
AAA Coaches Ltd	5.00	51.06	56.06	10
LA Travel	5.00	51.06	56.06	10
SD Travel Scotland Ltd	7.00	48.00	55.00	11
Abbot Travel	6.00	46.19	52.19	12
Festival Travel (Scotland) Ltd	7.00	41.25	48.25	13
Allan's Coaches Limited	7.00	39.60	46.60	14
E&M Horsburgh Ltd	7.00	35.75	42.75	15
AC's Taxis	8.00	33.00	41.00	17
Blue Bus Ltd	5.50	34.43	39.93	18

Lot 1: Vehicle and Driver – Unescorted. No specialist care, or equipment required.

Vehicle Type: Accessible Mini Bus

Supplier	Quality Score out of 10%	Cost Score out of 90%	100% of Tender to Final Score	Rank
Chauffeur Drive (Scotland) Ltd	7.50	90.00	97.50	1
GT Travel	6.00	89.47	95.47	2
Salmonds Mini Coach Hire Ltd	7.00	82.75	89.75	3

Carr Private Hire Ltd	5.50	74.87	80.37	4
H&M Ferguson Ltd	7.50	65.86	73.36	5
Avalon Scotland Ltd	5.50	64.17	69.67	6
Pro Race Scotland T/A Edinburgh Group Transport	7.00	62.15	69.15	7
Bodyshop Edinburgh T/A Coach Hire Edinburgh	7.00	61.30	68.30	8
Ratho Coaches Ltd	9.00	59.12	68.12	9
W&K Scott Ltd t/a Alba Coaches	7.50	59.12	66.62	10
SD Travel Scotland Ltd	7.00	54.45	61.45	11
AC's Taxis	8.00	37.43	45.43	12
Festival Travel (Scotland) Ltd	7.00	37.43	44.43	13
E&M Horsburgh Ltd	7.00	35.71	42.71	14

Lot 1: Vehicle and Driver – Unescorted. No specialist care, or equipment required.

Vehicle Type: PCV 17 to 35 Passenger Seats

Supplier	Quality Score out of 10%	Cost Score out of 90%	100% of Tender to Final Score	Rank
Charlie Irons Coaches	6.50	90.00	96.50	1
H&M Ferguson Ltd	7.50	59.92	67.42	2
Festival Travel (Scotland) Ltd	7.00	52.90	59.90	3
Salmonds Mini Coach Hire Ltd	7.00	52.86	59.86	4
Pro Race Scotland T/A Edinburgh Group Transport	7.00	51.44	58.44	5
Bodyshop Edinburgh T/A Coach Hire Edinburgh	7.00	51.14	58.14	6
Abbot Travel	6.00	51.04	57.04	7
Prentice Westwood Ltd.	7.00	47.91	54.91	8
Ratho Coaches Ltd	9.00	45.66	54.66	9
W&K Scott Ltd t/a Alba Coaches	7.50	45.66	53.16	10
AAA Coaches Ltd	5.00	44.93	49.93	11
LA Travel	5.00	44.93	49.93	11
E&M Horsburgh Ltd	7.00	31.95	38.95	12

AC's Taxis	8.00	28.92	36.92	13
Allan's Coaches Limited	7.00	28.92	35.92	14
SD Travel Scotland Ltd	7.00	27.99	34.99	15
Blue Bus Ltd	5.50	26.29	31.79	16
Midland Bluebird Limited / First Scotland East Limited	7.50	19.28	26.78	17

Lot 1: Vehicle and Driver – Unescorted. No specialist care, or equipment required.

Vehicle Type: PCV 36 to 55 Passenger Seats

Supplier	Quality Score out of 10%	Cost Score out of 90%	100% of Tender to Final Score	Rank
Charlie Irons Coaches	6.50	90.00	96.50	1
Festival Travel (Scotland) Ltd	7.00	55.65	62.65	2
Salmonds Mini Coach Hire Ltd	7.00	53.91	60.91	3
H&M Ferguson Ltd	7.50	46.35	53.85	4
Abbot Travel	6.00	45.63	51.63	5
Prentice Westwood Ltd.	7.00	42.67	49.67	6
Ratho Coaches Ltd	9.00	39.68	48.68	7
AAA Coaches Ltd	5.00	42.82	47.82	8
LA Travel	5.00	42.82	47.82	8
W&K Scott Ltd t/a Alba Coaches	7.50	39.68	47.18	9
Bodyshop Edinburgh T/A Coach Hire Edinburgh	7.00	39.68	46.68	10
Pro Race Scotland T/A Edinburgh Group Transport	7.00	38.03	45.03	11
E&M Horsburgh Ltd	7.00	32.38	39.38	12
AC's Taxis	8.00	30.42	38.42	13
Allan's Coaches Limited	7.00	28.52	35.52	14
SD Travel Scotland Ltd	7.00	23.70	30.70	15
Midland Bluebird Limited / First Scotland East Limited	7.50	18.62	26.12	16
Blue Bus Ltd	5.50	20.28	25.78	17
City Circle UK Ltd	6.50	18.07	24.57	18

Edinburgh Coach Lines Ltd	7.00	16.59	23.59	19
---------------------------	------	-------	-------	----

Lot 1: Vehicle and Driver – Unescorted. No specialist care, or equipment required.

Vehicle Type: PCV 56 or more Passenger Seats

Supplier	Quality Score out of 10%	Cost Score out of 90%	100% of Tender to Final Score	Rank
Charlie Irons Coaches	6.50	90.00	96.50	1
Festival Travel (Scotland) Ltd	7.00	61.19	68.19	2
Salmonds Mini Coach Hire Ltd	7.00	55.53	62.53	3
H&M Ferguson Ltd	7.50	45.82	53.32	4
Prentice Westwood Ltd.	7.00	42.45	49.45	5
Ratho Coaches Ltd	9.00	40.14	49.14	6
W&K Scott Ltd t/a Alba Coaches	7.50	40.14	47.64	7
AAA Coaches Ltd	5.00	42.50	47.50	8
LA Travel	5.00	42.50	47.50	8
Bodyshop Edinburgh T/A Coach Hire Edinburgh	7.00	36.49	43.49	9
Pro Race Scotland T/A Edinburgh Group Transport	7.00	35.84	42.84	10
E&M Horsburgh Ltd	7.00	35.69	42.69	11
Allan's Coaches Limited	7.00	29.51	36.51	12
SD Travel Scotland Ltd	7.00	25.41	32.41	13
Midland Bluebird Limited / First Scotland East Limited	7.50	18.25	25.75	14

Lot 2: Vehicle, Driver and Passenger Assistant. Specialist vehicle and/or equipment may be required.

Vehicle Type: Taxi / Private Hire Car up to 8 Passenger Seats

Supplier	Quality Score out of 10%	Cost Score out of 90%	100% of Tender to Final Score	Rank
Seven Sevens Cars Ltd, T/A Capital Cars	8.00	90.00	98.00	1
City Cabs Edinburgh Ltd	9.00	87.10	96.10	2
D&C Taxi's	4.50	60.83	65.33	3

L&M Taxis	4.50	60.54	65.04	4
B and G Taxis	4.50	60.35	64.85	5
WMD Private Hire	5.50	59.32	64.82	6
G&R Taxis	4.50	60.09	64.59	7
M&D Private Hire	5.00	58.35	63.35	8
1212 Taxis	6.50	56.25	62.75	9
Steven Kane Taxi Service	2.50	60.00	62.50	10
Westcroft Travel Ltd	6.00	54.92	60.92	11
J & K Private Hire	4.50	56.25	60.75	12
Cherry Private Hire	3.50	55.19	58.69	13
T&C Cabs	5.00	52.00	57.00	14
WD Taxis	4.50	51.14	55.64	15
GT Private Hire	2.50	42.84	45.34	16
Duddingston Transport Ltd	5.50	39.71	45.21	17
Edinburgh Taxis Ltd	3.50	41.32	44.82	18
Aerial A.B.W. Cabs Ltd	6.50	38.12	44.62	19
Masoka Ltd	5.50	37.50	43.00	20
Coulman Coaches Ltd	9.00	32.53	41.53	21
Edinburgh City Private Hire Ltd	6.50	34.70	41.20	22
E&R Taxis	4.00	36.64	40.64	23
Kinnaird Transport Services Ltd	6.00	34.62	40.62	24
P&S Transport	4.50	35.53	40.03	25
G and E Taxis Ltd	4.00	35.77	39.77	26
CC Taxis Ltd	5.00	34.77	39.77	26
S&M Pickering	6.00	32.93	38.93	27
JTS Cars	4.50	31.76	36.26	28
Hannings Ltd	6.50	29.35	35.85	29
GT Travel	6.00	29.65	35.65	30
Nancy McElhone	5.50	30.00	35.50	31
Pro Race Scotland T/A Edinburgh Group Transport	7.00	28.42	35.42	32

Chauffeur Drive (Scotland) Ltd	7.50	27.63	35.13	33
Bodyshop Edinburgh T/A Coach Hire Edinburgh	7.00	28.13	35.13	33
AC's Taxis	8.00	27.00	35.00	34
Shandon Travel Ltd	4.00	30.00	34.00	35
Carr Private Hire Ltd	5.50	28.13	33.63	36
DG Transport	4.50	28.80	33.30	37
Soave Minibus Hire	6.00	27.00	33.00	38
Avalon Scotland Ltd	5.50	27.44	32.94	39
JJC Taxis Ltd	6.00	26.32	32.32	40
Ratho Coaches Ltd	9.00	22.44	31.44	41
W&K Scott Ltd t/a Alba Coaches	7.50	22.44	29.94	42
Ian Mycko	5.00	23.68	28.68	43
H&M Ferguson Ltd	7.50	19.96	27.46	44
SD Travel Scotland Ltd	7.00	15.88	22.88	45
Blue Bus Ltd	5.50	16.88	22.38	46
Chauffeur Cars Scotland	5.50	12.98	18.48	47
Festival Travel (Scotland) Ltd	7.00	11.25	18.25	48

Lot 2: Vehicle, Driver and Passenger Assistant. Specialist vehicle and/or equipment may be required.

Vehicle Type: Mini Bus up to 16 Passenger Seats

Supplier	Quality Score out of 10%	Cost Score out of 90%	100% of Tender to Final Score	Rank
Charlie Irons Coaches	6.50	90.00	96.50	1
S&M Pickering	6.00	87.55	93.55	2
GT Travel	6.00	79.05	85.05	3
Ratho Coaches Ltd	9.00	57.04	66.04	4
W&K Scott Ltd t/a Alba Coaches	7.50	57.04	64.54	5
H&M Ferguson Ltd	7.50	56.48	63.98	6
Avalon Scotland Ltd	5.50	55.03	60.53	7
Salmonds Mini Coach Hire Ltd	7.00	51.36	58.36	8

Blue Bus Ltd	5.50	48.15	53.65	9
Bodyshop Edinburgh T/A Coach Hire Edinburgh	7.00	44.75	51.75	10
Pro Race Scotland T/A Edinburgh Group Transport	7.00	43.53	50.53	11
SD Travel Scotland Ltd	7.00	40.55	47.55	12
E&M Horsburgh Ltd	7.00	34.62	41.62	13
AC's Taxis	8.00	32.10	40.10	14
Festival Travel (Scotland) Ltd	7.00	32.10	39.10	15

Lot 2: Vehicle, Driver and Passenger Assistant. Specialist vehicle and/or equipment may be required.

Vehicle Type: Accessible Mini Bus

Supplier	Quality Score out of 10%	Cost Score out of 90%	100% of Tender to Final Score	Rank
DG Transport	4.50	90.00	94.50	1
GT Travel	6.00	85.95	91.95	2
Chauffeur Drive (Scotland) Ltd	7.50	82.92	90.42	3
Coulman Coaches Ltd	9.00	70.31	79.30	4
Carr Private Hire Ltd	5.50	70.31	75.81	5
Ian Mycko	5.00	66.96	71.96	6
H&M Ferguson Ltd	7.50	61.85	69.35	7
Avalon Scotland Ltd	5.50	60.26	65.76	8
Ratho Coaches Ltd	9.00	55.32	64.32	9
Salmonds Mini Coach Hire Ltd	7.00	56.24	63.24	10
W&K Scott Ltd t/a Alba Coaches	7.50	55.32	62.82	11
Pro Race Scotland T/A Edinburgh Group Transport	7.00	49.92	56.92	12
Bodyshop Edinburgh T/A Coach Hire Edinburgh	7.00	49.63	56.63	13
SD Travel Scotland Ltd	7.00	44.40	51.40	14
AC's Taxis	8.00	35.15	43.15	15
E&M Horsburgh Ltd	7.00	33.43	40.43	16

Festival Travel (Scotland) Ltd	7.00	32.45	39.45	17
--------------------------------	------	-------	-------	----

Lot 2: Vehicle, Driver and Passenger Assistant. Specialist vehicle and/or equipment may be required.

Vehicle Type: PCV 17 to 35 Passenger Seats

Supplier	Quality Score out of 10%	Cost Score out of 90%	100% of Tender to Final Score	Rank
Charlie Irons Coaches	6.50	90.00	96.50	1
H&M Ferguson Ltd	7.50	53.20	60.70	2
Salmonds Mini Coach Hire Ltd	7.00	51.36	58.36	3
Ratho Coaches Ltd	9.00	40.55	49.55	4
W&K Scott Ltd t/a Alba Coaches	7.50	40.55	48.05	5
Bodysshop Edinburgh T/A Coach Hire Edinburgh	7.00	33.84	40.84	6
Pro Race Scotland T/A Edinburgh Group Transport	7.00	32.37	39.37	7
E&M Horsburgh Ltd	7.00	28.44	35.44	8
AC's Taxis	8.00	25.68	33.68	9
SD Travel Scotland Ltd	7.00	22.66	29.66	10

Lot 3: Vehicle, Driver and Passenger Assistant. Specialist vehicle and/or equipment may be required for the transport of vulnerable children and adults.

Vehicle Type: Taxi / Private Hire Car up to 8 Passenger Seats

Supplier	Quality Score out of 10%	Cost Score out of 90%	100% of Tender to Final Score	Rank
Seven Sevens Cars Ltd, T/A Capital Cars	8.00	90.00	98.00	1
City Cabs Edinburgh Ltd	9.00	87.10	96.10	2
G&R Taxis	4.50	60.39	64.89	3
WMD Private Hire	5.50	57.74	63.24	4
L&M Taxis	4.50	58.08	62.58	5
Steven Kane Taxi Service	2.50	60.00	62.50	6
Westcroft Travel Ltd	6.00	55.86	61.86	7
B and G Taxis	4.50	56.35	60.85	8

J & K Private Hire	4.50	56.25	60.75	9
1212 Taxis	6.50	51.92	58.42	10
D&C Taxi's	4.50	53.62	58.12	11
M&D Private Hire	5.00	53.06	58.06	12
T&C Cabs	5.00	49.19	54.19	13
Cherry Private Hire	3.50	50.59	54.09	14
WD Taxis	4.50	49.39	53.89	15
GT Private Hire	2.50	43.98	46.48	16
Duddingston Transport Ltd	5.50	39.07	44.57	17
Aerial A.B.W. Cabs Ltd	6.50	37.24	43.74	18
Masoka Ltd	5.50	37.50	43.00	19
Coulman Coaches Ltd	9.00	32.53	41.53	20
Edinburgh City Private Hire Ltd	6.50	34.70	41.20	21
Kinnaird Transport Services Ltd	6.00	34.62	40.62	22
E&R Taxis	4.00	36.59	40.59	23
CC Taxis Ltd	5.00	34.77	39.77	24
G and E Taxis Ltd	4.00	35.58	39.58	25
P&S Transport	4.50	35.06	39.56	26
S&M Pickering	6.00	32.93	38.93	27
JTS Cars	4.50	31.76	36.26	28
Hannings Ltd	6.50	29.35	35.85	29
Edinburgh Taxis Ltd	3.50	32.14	35.64	30
Nancy McElhone	5.50	30.00	35.50	31
Chauffeur Drive (Scotland) Ltd	7.50	27.59	35.09	32
AC's Taxis	8.00	27.00	35.00	33
Shandon Travel Ltd	4.00	30.00	34.00	34
Carr Private Hire Ltd	5.50	28.13	33.63	35
GT Travel	6.00	27.30	33.30	36
DG Transport	4.50	28.80	33.30	36
Avalon Scotland Ltd	5.50	27.44	32.94	37

Pro Race Scotland T/A Edinburgh Group Transport	7.00	25.71	32.71	38
Bodyshop Edinburgh T/A Coach Hire Edinburgh	7.00	25.47	32.47	39
JJC Taxis Ltd	6.00	26.32	32.32	40
Ratho Coaches Ltd	9.00	21.95	30.95	41
W&K Scott Ltd t/a Alba Coaches	7.50	21.95	29.45	42
Ian Mycko	5.00	23.68	28.68	43
H&M Ferguson Ltd	7.50	20.49	27.99	44
SD Travel Scotland Ltd	7.00	16.36	23.36	45
Blue Bus Ltd	5.50	14.21	19.71	46
Chauffeur Cars Scotland	5.50	12.98	18.48	47

Lot 3: Vehicle, Driver and Passenger Assistant. Specialist vehicle and/or equipment may be required for the transport of vulnerable children and adults.

Vehicle Type: Mini Bus up to 16 Passenger Seats

Supplier	Quality Score out of 10%	Cost Score out of 90%	100% of Tender to Final Score	Rank
Charlie Irons Coaches	6.50	90.00	96.50	1
S&M Pickering	6.00	87.55	93.55	2
H&M Ferguson Ltd	7.50	58.45	65.95	3
Ratho Coaches Ltd	9.00	53.69	62.69	4
W&K Scott Ltd t/a Alba Coaches	7.50	53.69	61.19	5
Avalon Scotland Ltd	5.50	55.03	60.53	6
Salmonds Mini Coach Hire Ltd	7.00	51.36	58.36	7
Pro Race Scotland T/A Edinburgh Group Transport	7.00	43.04	50.04	8
Bodyshop Edinburgh T/A Coach Hire Edinburgh	7.00	42.80	49.80	9
SD Travel Scotland Ltd	7.00	40.55	47.55	10
AC's Taxis	8.00	32.10	40.10	11
Blue Bus Ltd	5.50	28.53	34.03	12

Lot 3: Vehicle, Driver and Passenger Assistant. Specialist vehicle and/or equipment may be required for the transport of vulnerable children and adults.

Vehicle Type: Accessible Mini Bus

Supplier	Quality Score out of 10%	Cost Score out of 90%	100% of Tender to Final Score	Rank
DG Transport	4.50	90.00	94.50	1
Chauffeur Drive (Scotland) Ltd	7.50	75.87	83.37	2
Coulman Coaches Ltd	9.00	70.31	79.31	3
Carr Private Hire Ltd	5.50	70.31	75.81	4
Ian Mycko	5.00	66.96	71.96	5
H&M Ferguson Ltd	7.50	64.01	71.51	6
Ratho Coaches Ltd	9.00	58.79	67.79	7
W&K Scott Ltd t/a Alba Coaches	7.50	58.79	66.29	8
Avalon Scotland Ltd	5.50	60.26	65.76	9
Salmonds Mini Coach Hire Ltd	7.00	56.24	63.24	10
Bodyshop Edinburgh T/A Coach Hire Edinburgh	7.00	47.46	54.46	11
Pro Race Scotland T/A Edinburgh Group Transport	7.00	47.43	54.43	12
SD Travel Scotland Ltd	7.00	44.40	51.40	13
AC's Taxis	8.00	35.15	43.15	14

Lot 3: Vehicle, Driver and Passenger Assistant. Specialist vehicle and/or equipment may be required for the transport of vulnerable children and adults.

Vehicle Type: PCV 17 to 35 Passenger Seats

Supplier	Quality Score out of 10%	Cost Score out of 90%	100% of Tender to Final Score	Rank
Charlie Irons Coaches	6.50	90.00	96.50	1
H&M Ferguson Ltd	7.50	53.20	60.70	2
Salmonds Mini Coach Hire Ltd	7.00	45.32	52.32	3
Ratho Coaches Ltd	9.00	40.55	49.55	4
W&K Scott Ltd t/a Alba Coaches	7.50	40.55	48.05	5

Pro Race Scotland T/A Edinburgh Group Transport	7.00	32.37	39.37	6
Bodyshop Edinburgh T/A Coach Hire Edinburgh	7.00	32.10	39.10	7
AC's Taxis	8.00	25.68	33.68	8
SD Travel Scotland Ltd	7.00	22.66	29.66	9

Lot 4: Out of Authority Routes

Destinations and originating locations outside the City of Edinburgh Council local authority area

Supplier	Quality Score out of 10%	Cost Score out of 90%	100% of Tender to Final Score	Rank
Bodyshop Edinburgh T/A Coach Hire Edinburgh	7.00	90.00	97.00	1
Pro Race Scotland T/A Edinburgh Group Transport	7.00	90.00	97.00	1
Aerial A.B.W. Cabs Ltd	6.50	70.65	77.15	2
CC Taxis Ltd	5.00	69.23	74.23	3
WD Taxis	4.50	67.50	72.00	4
Coulman Coaches Ltd	9.00	61.93	70.93	5
1212 Taxis	6.50	62.90	69.40	6
Seven Sevens Cars Ltd, T/A Capital Cars	8.00	61.36	69.36	7
Transport Innovation Ltd	7.50	61.36	68.86	8
AC's Taxis	8.00	56.60	64.60	9
Chauffeur Cars Scotland	5.50	58.70	64.20	10
Allthefours Inc	6.00	57.69	63.69	11
Edinburgh Taxis Ltd	3.50	59.17	62.67	12
Abbot Travel	6.00	56.03	62.03	13
GT Travel	6.00	55.45	61.45	14
City Cabs Edinburgh Ltd	9.00	49.09	58.09	15
Cherry Private Hire	3.50	54.00	57.50	16
H&M Ferguson Ltd	7.50	50.00	57.50	16
JTS Cars	4.50	52.83	57.33	17

G&R Taxis	4.50	51.92	56.42	18
Edinburgh City Private Hire Ltd	6.50	49.09	55.59	19
B and G Taxis	4.50	50.94	55.44	20
L&M Taxis	4.50	49.09	53.59	21
Steven Kane Taxi Service	2.50	48.21	50.71	22
D&C Taxi's	4.50	45.76	50.26	23
P&S Transport	4.50	45.00	49.50	24
Kinnaird Transport Services Ltd	6.00	43.14	49.14	25
Duddingston Transport Ltd	5.50	42.78	48.28	26
Salmonds Mini Coach Hire Ltd	7.00	39.58	46.58	27
Westcroft Travel Ltd	6.00	38.57	44.57	28
WMD Private Hire	5.50	38.68	44.18	29
Carr Private Hire Ltd	5.50	38.57	44.07	30
Shandon Travel Ltd	4.00	38.57	42.57	31
SD Travel Scotland Ltd	7.00	35.22	42.22	32
S&M Pickering	6.00	35.53	41.53	33
Avalon Scotland Ltd	5.50	33.75	39.25	34
T&C Cabs	5.00	33.75	38.75	35
GT Private Hire	2.50	33.75	36.25	36
Midlothian Private Hire Taxis	7.00	27.00	34.00	37
Chauffeur Drive (Scotland) Ltd	7.50	25.40	32.90	38
M&D Private Hire	5.00	27.00	32.00	39
Ratho Coaches Ltd	9.00	21.10	30.10	40
Masoka Ltd	5.50	24.55	30.05	41
Hannings Ltd	6.50	23.20	29.70	42
JJC Taxis Ltd	6.00	23.68	29.68	43
W&K Scott Ltd t/a Alba Coaches	7.50	21.10	28.60	44
Nancy McElhone	5.50	16.88	22.38	45
Allan's Coaches Limited	7.00	14.58	21.58	46
Garrieth Graham	6.00	5.59	11.59	47

Blue Bus Ltd	5.50	3.86	9.36	48
--------------	------	------	------	----